

Unveiling the Layers of Fair Use: Exploring Transformative Use Analyses and Derivative Works in Copyright Law through AWF vs Goldsmith

Assistant Professor Dr. Wariya Lamlert^{*}
Assistant Professor Dr. Kiarttiphorn Umpai^{**}
Dr. Sasina Nimsuwan^{***}

Received Date 8 May 2024; Revised Date 17 July 2024; Accepted Date 13 August 2024

Abstract

This article explores the complex relationship between fair use doctrine, transformative use analyses, and derivative works in copyright law, focusing on the significant case of AWF vs Goldsmith. The article provides a thorough analysis that highlights the intricate difficulties and obstacles involved in the application of fair use principles to artistic interpretation and reinterpretation in the digital era.

By referencing legal precedents, scholarly literature, and real-world examples, the article provides valuable insights into the changing landscape of fair use doctrine and how it affects the analysis of transformative use and the rights of copyright owners to create derivative works. It explores key concepts such as the purpose and character of the use, the nature of the copyrighted work, the amount and substantiality of the portion used, and the effect on the potential market for the original work.

^{*} Assistant Professor, Part Time Lecturer, School of Law, National Institute of Development Administration

^{**} Assistant Professor, School of Law, National Institute of Development Administration

^{***} Lecturer, Department of Law, Faculty of Social Sciences, Kasetsart University

Unveiling the Layers of Fair Use: Exploring Transformative Use Analyses and Derivative Works in Copyright Law through AWF vs Goldsmith

The article engages in insightful discussions, examining the insights gained from the AWF vs Goldsmith case. It emphasizes the significance of transformative interpretation, the difficulties in striking a balance between rights, the influence of legal precedent, and the dynamic nature of copyright law in response to technological progress and evolving creative methods. With potential future developments in this field taken into account, the article concludes with astute recommendations for navigating the complexities of copyright law pertaining to fair use, transformative use, and derivative works. By means of ongoing discourse, adaptation, and debate, the fair use doctrine should be prevented from becoming a static and inequitable framework for fostering innovation, cultural exchange, and creativity in the digital age.

Keyword: Fair Use, Transformative Use, Derivative Works

Unveiling the Layers of Fair Use: Exploring Transformative Use Analyses
and Derivative Works in Copyright Law through AWF vs Goldsmith

References

- Andy Warhol Foundation for the Visual Arts, Inc. v. Goldsmith, 598 U.S. 508 (2023).
- David Tan, ‘The transformative use doctrine and fair dealing in Singapore: Understanding the” purpose and character” of appropriation art’ (2012) 24 Singapore Academy of Law Journal 832.
- Edward D. Lanquist and Dominic Rota, ‘The Impact of the Supreme Court’s Goldsmith Decision on Copyright Enforcement Against Ai Tools’ <<https://www.bakerdonelson.com/the-impact-of-the-supreme-courts-goldsmith-decision-on-copyright-enforcement-against-ai-tools>> accessed 9 July 2024.
- Emre Turan, ‘Embracing Art in the Digital Age’ (Medium, 20 February, 2024) <<https://medium.com/@emreturann/embracing-art-in-the-digital-age-5c6900a7d629>> accessed 21 April 2024.
- Jiarui Liu, ‘An empirical study of transformative use in copyright law’ (2019) 1 Stanford Technology Law Review 163.
- Kamila Kempfert and Wolfgang Reißmann, ‘Transformative works and German copyright law as matters of boundary work’ (2017) 2 Media in Action. Interdisciplinary Journal on Cooperative Media 65.
- Kevin Madigan, ‘Landmark Warhol Decision Reins in Transformative Fair Use’ (copyrightalliance, 19 May 2023) <<https://copyrightalliance.org/warhol-decision-reins-transformative-fair-use/>> accessed 15 April 2024.
- Laurie Tomassian, ‘Transforming the Fair Use Landscape by Defining the Transformative Factor’ (2016) 6 Southern California Law Review Admin 1329.
- Lawrence Hurley, ‘Supreme Court rules against Warhol foundation in copyright fight over Prince images’ (NBCNews, 18 May 2023) <<https://www.nbcnews.com/politics/supreme-court/supreme-court-rules-warhol-foundation-copyright-fight-prince-images-rcna64624>> accessed 21 April 2024.

Mary W.S. Wong, 'Transformative user-generated content in copyright law: Infringing derivative works or fair use' (2008) 4 Vanderbilt Journal of Entertainment & Technology Law 1075, 1075.

Mathilde Halle, 'R. Prince's New Portraits-The Art of Fair Use' (2017) 2 Chicago-Kent Journal of Intellectual Property 322, 322.

Michael J. Madison, 'Rewriting fair use and the future of copyright reform' (2005) Cardozo Arts and Entertainment Law Journal 391, 391.

Nicolas Suzor, 'Transformative use of copyright material' (Doctoral dissertation, Queensland University of Technology 2006) <<https://eprints.qut.edu.au/16226/>> accessed 12 July 2024.

Puljith Gayon, 'Intellectual Property Rights: Balancing Innovation, Accessibility, and Ethical Concerns' (linkedin, 30 April 2023) <<https://www.linkedin.com/pulse/intellectual-property-rights-balancing-innovation-ethical-gayon>> accessed 5 March 2024.

Racheal Adams, 'The evolution of intellectual property rights in the digital age' (2023) 2 Journal of Modern Law and Policy, 52-63.

Richard Stim, 'Fair Use: What Is Transformative?' <<https://www.nolo.com/legal-encyclopedia/fair-use-what-transformative.html>> accessed 26 April 2024.

Sani Zangrando Law Firm, 'The U.S. Supreme Court rules against the Warhol's foundation in copyright dispute over Prince artwork' (lexology, 2023). <<https://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=11dca630-e71a-4212-8b9c-a31d8e2e48d8>> accessed 20 April 2024.

Sarah Cascone, 'In a Landmark Ruling Against the Andy Warhol Foundation, the Supreme Court Has Sided with Photographer Lynn Goldsmith' (artnet, 18 May 2023) <<https://news.artnet.com/art-world/the-supreme-court-ruling-lynn-goldsmith-andy-warhol-foundation-2304684>> accessed 21 April 2024.

Unveiling the Layers of Fair Use: Exploring Transformative Use Analyses
and Derivative Works in Copyright Law through AWF vs Goldsmith

Silvia Marchi, ‘The Prince portrait: Lynn Goldsmith vs Andy Warhol’ (HFG Law & Intellectual Property, 27 April 2021) <<https://www.hfgip.com/news/prince-portrait-lynn-goldsmith-vs-andy-warhol>> accessed 22 April 2024.

Thomas Crowe and Paul Kallenbach, ‘Cultural icons, fair use and AI – the Prince decision and the future of copyright’ (2023) <<https://www.minterellison.com>> accessed 1 May 2024.

articles/cultural-icons-fair-use-and-ai-the-prince-decision-and-the-future-of-copyright> accessed 1 May 2024.

UNESCO, ‘Reshaping policies for creativity: addressing culture as a global public good’ (2022) <<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000380474>> accessed 23 March 2024.

William Patry, ‘Andy Warhol Foundation for the Visual Arts, Inc. v Goldsmith: did the US Supreme Court tighten up fair use?’ (2023) 9 Journal of Intellectual Property Law and Practice 628.